

## CONTEXTUALIZATION OF HADITH ABOUT MUSIC: Perspectives of Hadith Scholars and Dilthey's Hermeneutics

*Budi Ichwayudi, Brilian Alim, Aida Hidayatul, Febi Rahma*

---

Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel Surabaya  
Jl. Ahmad Yani, No. 117 Jemur Wonosari, Surabaya, Jawa Timur  
e-mail: [budi.Ichwayudi@gmail.com](mailto:budi.Ichwayudi@gmail.com), [abilalim76@gmail.com](mailto:abilalim76@gmail.com), [aidahidayatulmustafidah@gmail.com](mailto:aidahidayatulmustafidah@gmail.com),  
[febirahmaaliya@gmail.com](mailto:febirahmaaliya@gmail.com)

---

**Abstrak:** Perbedaan pendapat mengenai hukum musik dalam Islam terus menjadi perdebatan di masyarakat modern. Musik yang kini berkembang pesat memiliki peran yang kompleks, tidak hanya sebagai hiburan tetapi juga sebagai sarana terapi dan ekspresi sosial. Di sisi lain, terdapat hadis-hadis yang secara tekstual tampak melarang musik, sehingga menimbulkan interpretasi yang beragam. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menganalisis pemahaman hadis tentang musik dengan menggunakan teori hermeneutika Wilhelm Dilthey, yang menekankan pentingnya memahami teks dalam konteks sosial, budaya, dan sejarahnya. Penelitian ini menggunakan metode kualitatif dengan pendekatan hermeneutika untuk menggali makna hadis tentang musik dalam konteks waktu dan tempatnya. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa penerapan hermeneutika Dilthey memungkinkan pemahaman yang lebih kontekstual dan historis terhadap hadis tersebut. Larangan dalam hadis tentang musik lebih berkaitan dengan kondisi sosial masyarakat Arab saat itu, di mana musik sering dikaitkan dengan perilaku berlebihan yang dapat menimbulkan dosa. Dengan mempertimbangkan prinsip maqasid syariah, musik yang dimanfaatkan untuk tujuan positif dapat tetap relevan dan tidak bertentangan dengan nilai-nilai Islam. Implikasi dari penelitian ini adalah perlunya pendekatan kontekstual dalam memahami hadis, sehingga interpretasi yang dihasilkan lebih sesuai dengan perkembangan zaman dan kebutuhan umat Islam saat ini.

**Kata Kunci:** Hadis Musik, Hermeneutika Wilhelm Dilthey, Studi Hadis

**Abstract:** Differences of opinion regarding the laws of music in Islam continue to be debated in modern society. Music, which is now developing rapidly, has a complex role, not only as entertainment but also as a means of therapy and social expression. On the other hand, there are hadiths that textually appear to prohibit music, giving rise to diverse interpretations. This study aims to analyze the understanding of the hadith about music by using Wilhelm Dilthey's hermeneutics theory, which emphasizes the importance of understanding the text in its social, cultural, and historical context. This study uses a qualitative method with a hermeneutics approach to explore the meaning of the hadith about music in its context of time and place. The results show that the application of Dilthey's hermeneutics allows for a more contextual and historical understanding of the hadith. The prohibition in the hadith about music is more related to the social conditions of the Arab society at that time, where music was often associated with excessive behavior that could lead to sin. By considering the principle of Islamic purpose, music that is used for positive purposes can remain relevant and not contradict Islamic values. The implication of this study is the need for a contextual approach in understanding hadith, so that the resulting interpretation is more in line with the times and the needs of Muslims today.

**Keywords:** Hadith Music, Wilhelm Dilthey Hermeneutics, Hadith Studies

## INTRUDUCTION

Understanding hadith in a modern context has become increasingly important along with the complexity of the challenges faced by society today. Hadith as the source of Islamic teachings after the Qur'an has a very important position in shaping the legal and moral views of Muslims. However, the understanding of hadith often faces challenges due to the differences in social, cultural and historical contexts between the time of the hadith's revelation and the conditions of modern society. One issue that is often debated is the traditions related to music (Fauzi, 2023). In the history of Islamic thought, there are various views of scholars regarding the law of music, ranging from those who absolutely forbid it to those who allow it under certain conditions. Therefore, the study of music hadith with a contextual approach is very important so that Muslims can understand the teachings of the Prophet more comprehensively and in accordance with the reality of life today (Amrulloh, 2015).

In the study of hadith, the contextual approach has been the concern of scholars for a long time. One of the contemporary scholars who have emphasized the importance of contextualizing hadith is Yusuf al-Qaradawi. He argues that hadith cannot be understood in isolation from the historical and cultural context in which it emerged (Priyatna, 2025). Therefore, a comprehensive approach that considers various related traditions on a single theme becomes very important. In his view, the understanding of hadith must be in harmony with the general principles in the Qur'an and

the maqasid of sharia in order to remain relevant to the times. This approach aims to ensure that the interpretation of hadith is not only textual but also contextual so that it can be applied fairly and proportionately in the life of modern society (Hafidhuddin, 2022).

On the other hand, Wilhelm Dilthey, a German philosopher, offers a hermeneutic perspective that emphasizes the importance of understanding texts in their social, cultural and historical contexts. The main concept in Dilthey's hermeneutics is *Verstehen*, which is an attempt to understand the deep meaning of human experience in a particular context. In hadith studies, Dilthey's hermeneutic approach can be used to analyze music hadith in a more comprehensive way (Sitorus et al., 2022). By taking into account the social and cultural factors surrounding the Arab society at the time of the Prophet, this approach allows for a more contextualized interpretation of the hadith so that its meaning can be better understood in modern life. Dilthey's hermeneutics seeks to bridge the gap between objective facts and subjective experience, thus enabling a more holistic understanding of a text (Sidik & Sulistyana, 2021).

Some previous studies have examined the issue of music in an Islamic perspective, but none has specifically examined music hadith through Dilthey's hermeneutic approach. One of the relevant studies is a thesis entitled *The Art of Music in Quraish Shihab's Perspective in Tafsir Al-Misbah by Yusron Faza Alfafa* (2023). This research discusses Quraish Shihab's view on music in his tafsir, which shows that music is not necessarily prohibited in Islam,

depending on the context of its use. However, this study focuses more on the interpretation of the Qur'an and does not specifically discuss musical hadith in a hermeneutical perspective.

Another relevant research is a journal article entitled *Music and Song Art in Islamic Perspective* by Rahman et al., (2024). This article discusses the position of music in Islam from the perspective of fiqh and culture. The resulting conclusion shows that the law of music in Islam is highly dependent on the context in which it is used, whether it brings benefits or causes harm. Although this study provides important insights into music in Islam, its approach is still general and has not examined music hadith specifically using the hermeneutical method.

In addition, a study entitled *Music in Islam: A Critical Analysis of Hadiths Related to Music* conducted by Aziz (2009) is also relevant to this topic. The study analyzed various traditions related to music and how classical and contemporary scholars interpreted these traditions. One of the main findings of this study is that there is a significant difference in interpretation between the more textualist scholars and the more contextualist scholars. However, this study has not used a hermeneutical approach explicitly, so there is still room for a more in-depth analysis using Dilthey's hermeneutical theory.

The fourth relevant research is a study entitled *Hermeneutics in Hadith Studies: A Study of the Thought of Fazlur Rahman* by Ma'arif (2017). This study highlights how hermeneutics can be applied

in hadith studies to obtain a more contextual understanding. Fazlur Rahman developed the double movement method, an approach that seeks to understand the historical context of a hadith and then relate it to the modern context. While this study provides important insights into the application of hermeneutics in hadith studies, it does not specifically address music hadith and Dilthey's hermeneutical approach.

The fifth relevant research is a study conducted by Asep Yeni & Kurniawan (2024) with the title *Music in the View of Classical and Contemporary Scholars*. This study compares the views of classical scholars such as Ibn Taymiyyah and Imam Al-Ghazali with contemporary scholars such as Yusuf al-Qaradawi regarding the law of music in Islam. This study shows that there is a tendency for classical scholars to be more strict in prohibiting music, while contemporary scholars are more flexible in seeing music as part of modern life that can provide positive benefits. However, this study has not used Dilthey's hermeneutic approach in analyzing music hadith, so there are still research gaps that can be filled.

From these five studies, it can be concluded that there is no study that specifically discusses music hadith using Wilhelm Dilthey's hermeneutic approach. Most of the existing studies focus more on fiqh analysis, Qur'anic exegesis, or the hermeneutical approach in general in hadith studies. Therefore, this study has a clear distinction in filling the academic gap that has not been touched by previous research.

This research has several significant academic contributions. First, it will provide

new insights in hadith studies by applying Dilthey's hermeneutics, which emphasizes the importance of understanding texts in their historical, cultural and social contexts. This approach will help provide a more contextualized understanding of music hadith so that Muslims can apply religious teachings more relevantly in modern life. Secondly, this research will contribute to the scholarly discussion on the law of music in Islam by presenting a new perspective that is more contextual and historical. This is important to answer the various debates that still occur among Muslims regarding the legal status of music in Islam. Third, this research will enrich the study of hermeneutics in Islamic studies by showing how the hermeneutical methods of Western thinkers can be applied in hadith studies without neglecting Islamic principles.

Considering the importance of understanding hadith in its social and cultural context, this study is expected to make a meaningful contribution to the development of hadith science and a more contextualized understanding of Islam. The application of Dilthey's hermeneutics in the study of musical hadith will help unravel the differences of opinion and provide a deeper understanding of how hadith should be understood in the modern context. Thus, this research becomes an important academic endeavor in bridging the classical traditions of Islam with the challenges and dynamics of contemporary life.

## **METHOD**

This study uses a qualitative method with Wilhelm Dilthey's hermeneutic

approach to analyze hadith about music in the perspective of hadith scholars and Dilthey's hermeneutics. This approach emphasizes the importance of understanding the text in its social, cultural and historical context, thus providing a more comprehensive interpretation. This method was chosen because it suits the purpose of the study, which is to understand the hadith contextually and explore how Dilthey's hermeneutical theory can be used in understanding the meaning of the hadith about music.

This type of research is descriptive-analytical, which aims to describe, interpret, and analyze the understanding of music hadith by referring to the principles of hermeneutics. This research not only explores the literal text of the hadith, but also looks at how it has been understood and applied by scholars in various historical contexts.

The research data sources consist of primary and secondary data. Primary data includes hadith texts related to the ruling of music, especially those that have been debated among classical and contemporary scholars. Secondary data includes various literatures that support this analysis, including works of hadith interpretation, writings of scholars such as Yusuf Al-Qardhawi, Dilthey's hermeneutic theory, as well as various scientific studies relevant to the research theme.

Data collection techniques were carried out through library research, by collecting, examining, and analyzing various references related to hadith about music and Dilthey's hermeneutic theory. The data

obtained is then analyzed using the hermeneutic method, focusing on the main concepts in Dilthey's theory, such as experience (*Erlebnis*), expression (*Ausdruck*), and understanding (*Verstehen*).

Data analysis in this study was conducted through several stages. First, identification and classification of the traditions that discuss music as well as the interpretations developed in the various schools of Islam. Second, Dilthey's hermeneutic approach is applied by understanding the hadith in its social, cultural, and historical contexts, including considering the factors that influenced the emergence of the hadith. Third, the hadith about music is contextualized by considering the conditions and challenges of modern society, using maqasid sharia as the main foundation in assessing the relevance of music law in Islam.

With this approach, this study is expected to provide a more contextual and flexible interpretation of the hadith about music, without ignoring the basic principles of Islamic teachings. It also offers a new perspective in understanding hadith with a method that is more in line with today's social and cultural realities.

## RESULT AND DISCUSSION

### Understanding contextualized hadith from Yusuf Qardhawi's perspective

Yusuf Qardhawi is an intelligent person, from a religious family, as evidenced by his best achievements at Al-Azhar University in the faculty of Ushuluddin, then continued to Arabic literature and philosophy. His works are very varied, both in terms of fiqh, the study of the Qur'an and

as-sunnah, the field of kalam science, and the field of shari'at (Wahidi et al., 2022). Yusuf Qardhawi revealed that in understanding the hadith, the guidance of the Qur'an is needed.

1. Understand the hadith in accordance with the Qur'anic instructions.

According to Qardhawi, in understanding the hadith it is not enough to rely on the hadith alone, but also requires the guidance of the Qur'an. A sahih hadith cannot contradict the Qur'an, even if such a hadith does exist then it clearly cannot be said to be a sahih hadith. Qardhawi's point is consistent with the rule of hadith as an explanation of the Qur'an.

2. Understanding hadith by compiling traditions of the same theme.

In order to perfectly understand the hadith Yusuf Qardhawi also needs to collect the hadith as a whole that is similar. Then the traditions that have unclear meanings are linked to those that already have clear meanings, those that still have limited meanings to those that have unlimited meanings and then interpreted specifically. So if there is something that cannot be understood in one hadith then its clarity can be re-understood from the corresponding hadith.

3. The merging of seemingly contradictory traditions.

The combination of conflicting traditions is also Qardhawi's understanding, as it is often found that one tradition and another tradition have conflicting meanings. The understanding of hadith scholars whose understanding is contradictory can be done if the traditions are both sahih, or at least the hadith is hasan. Yusuf Al-Qardhawi

responds to the contradiction of this hadith by combining the two *Nash* then mentarjih between the two. From this, a lesson will be found from each hadith which turns out that both are acceptable (Hasan, 2020; Syahid, 2020).

#### 4. Understand the hadith according to the background.

Understanding the hadith according to the background, in understanding the hadith, it is necessary to understand the background or according to Qardhawi is *asbab al-wurud*, which is a historical approach that leads to the historical conditions in which the hadith appeared, what the circumstances were at that time, what the hadith was said for, and where. In such ways the hadith can be clearly understood without any distorted thoughts. Distinguishing between changing means and fixed goals (Izza, 2014).

A means that bears fruit and remains distinguishable, many people misunderstand the sunnah of the prophet and assume that certain means or infrastructure is the goal. Whereas the important goal is what the as-sunnah is trying to achieve. Since the means can change with the passage of time, it is necessary to sort out the means properly so as not to lose the core purpose of the sunnah itself. While the means are the traditions of the times, speakers, and conditions, the goal is the benefit of the ummah.

#### 5. Distinguishing between *haqiqi* and *majazi*

A hadith *that is haqiqi* means that it expresses its true meaning and a hadith that uses language that needs to be reinterpreted for clarity.

#### 6. Distinguishing between the *Gharib* and the real

Hadiths certainly contain discussions about the supernatural such as Satan, angels and so on. For Yusuf al-Qardhawi the hadith must still be accepted because there is no reason to reject the hadith just because it cannot be understood by humans.

### **Hadith Understanding Rules According to Shuhudi Ismail**

Syuhudi Ismail's rules of understanding hadith are very helpful in the development of hadith studies, especially in terms of contextualization and relevance to contemporary life (Makmur & Ismail, 2021). Three important steps in understanding and analyzing hadith are outlined by Syuhudi Ismail. They are text analysis, identification of historical context, and contextualization of hadith (Sani, 2023; Sulidar et al., 2022).

#### 1. Text Analysis (matan criticism)

Syuhudi Ismail begins by conducting an in-depth analysis of the hadith text. In matan criticism, he examines the content or meaning of the hadith texts to ensure that they conform to the broader principles of Islam, including Quranic verses, common sense, and worldly realities. According to Shuhudi, traditions should not be taken literally without considering their meaning. Consequently, he investigates the linguistic elements, grammar, and narrative structure of the hadith.

For example, a hadith that seems to contradict the principles of justice or compassion on which Islam is based needs to be further analyzed. This may include determining whether there has been a misunderstanding in translation or searching

for the meaning of key words in classical Arabic. In this way, Syuhudi tries to ensure that the traditions under study will not be misinterpreted or misused in modern interpretations.

## 2. Identification of Historical Context (*Asbab al-Wurud*)

In addition to analyzing the text, an important step in Syuhudi's approach is to identify the historical context, or in hadith scholarship called *Asbab al-Wurud*. This is because it helps us understand why a hadith arose, who heard it, and what situation it faced at the time. This principle is very similar to *asbab al-nuzul* in Quranic exegetical studies.

Hadiths that apply to specific and local situations are different from those that have universal value, so an understanding of the historical context is also necessary. Syuhudi realized that many traditions arose in social and cultural situations different from the modern reality. Hence it is important to clarify whether a hadith is applicable to all situations or only to a particular situation. Through this method he tries to avoid false generalizations about particular traditions.

## 3. Contextualization of Hadith

The concept of contextualization of hadith is considered one of Syuhudi's most important contributions. The aim of this contextualization is to incorporate the universal values contained in the hadith into contemporary life while maintaining the essence of Islamic teachings. Hadiths are regarded as a source of morality that can be applied in various social and temporal contexts rather than rules that must be

followed literally. Syuhudi argues that Islam is a flexible religion that is relevant in every time and place.

Therefore, when applying hadith to the modern world, it must take into account the current social, economic, cultural and political circumstances. This method of contextualization allows Muslims to practice the teachings of Islam dynamically without being trapped in a literal understanding that may not suit the challenges of modern times. For example, a hadith relating to economic practices in Arabia in the 7th century AD cannot be used directly in today's global economic system. The complicated and complex economic problems of modern times are not the same as the economic problems of the past.

## 4. Relevance in the Modern Context

Syuhudi focuses on practical application in modern Muslim societies. He emphasized that modern Islamic legal policies should be based on universal principles such as justice, transparency, and moral responsibility. He encourages Islamic scholars to update their understanding of the hadith to keep it relevant to the times, especially in relation to modern issues such as democracy, human rights, and gender equality.

## **Contextual Hadith and the Rules of Understanding According to Nuruddin**

Nuruddin provides important guidelines for understanding hadith with a comprehensive approach that takes into account the context, the sources of the Shari'ah, the language, and the grand purpose of the Islamic Shari'ah. These rules

encourage the understanding of hadith to always be relevant to the times without losing the essence of the teachings of the Prophet Muhammad.

### 1. Contextualized Hadith

Understanding hadith contextually means relating the meaning of the hadith to the context of the time, place and situation in which it was uttered. In understanding contextual hadith, it is necessary to consider the social, cultural, political background and situation of the society at the time of the Prophet. This aims to determine whether the laws or teachings contained in the hadith are permanent (universal) or temporary (situational), depending on the influencing factors at the time (Ismail, 1994).

Contextual understanding is particularly relevant in the modern era, where new challenges require careful interpretation of hadith teachings to remain relevant. Scholars have often emphasized the need to consider *maqasid al-shariah* (the purpose of the Shariah) in understanding hadith, i.e. prioritizing the principles of justice, benefit and mercy in all aspects of Islamic teachings.

### 2. Rules for Understanding Hadith According to Nuruddin

Nuruddin 'Itr, one of the contemporary scholars of hadith, emphasized the importance of understanding hadith using a comprehensive method (Asaad, 2019; I. R. Siregar, 2024). The following are some of the rules underlined by him:

### 3. Understanding Hadith with the Qur'an (*al-Tafsir bi al-Qur'an*)

One of the main rules of hadith comprehension is to ensure that the

interpretation of the hadith does not contradict the basic principles found in the Qur'an. The Qur'ān is the first source of Islamic teachings and hadith should be interpreted in line with the more fundamental teachings of the Qur'an.

### 2. Understanding Hadith with Other Hadith

The second rule is to use other relevant traditions to clarify the meaning of a tradition. Some traditions may provide only partial information or perspective while others may provide a clearer context. This is part of the method of harmonization (*al-jam' wa al-taufiq*) used to avoid contradictions.

### 3. Understanding Hadith Based on *Asbab al-Wurud*

Like the Qur'an, the hadith also has a background of reasons for its revelation or *asbab al-wurud*. Knowing the specific context behind the Prophet's utterance or action helps in determining whether the tradition is generally applicable or applicable only in certain circumstances.

### 4. Understanding the Meaning of Language in Hadith (*al-Lughah al-Arabiyyah*)

Mastering the Arabic language and understanding the language styles used in the hadith is very important in understanding the hadith correctly. Many hadith traditions use *majas*, *kinayah*, and symbolic expressions, so a deep understanding of the language is required to interpret the intended meaning.

### 5. Considering the Purpose of Sharia (*Maqasid al-Shariah*)

The understanding of hadith should not be divorced from the larger objectives of Islamic law, which are to achieve justice, prosperity and the protection of human rights. According to Nuruddin, interpreting



the hadith should always consider the impact of its application on society and whether it is in line with the general objectives of the Shari'ah.

#### 6. Understanding Based on Consensus of Scholars (*Ijma'*)

In cases where there is confusion or uncertainty in the interpretation of the hadith, another rule to be considered is *ijma'* (consensus of scholars). *Ijma'* can be used as a guide to understand the hadith in a way that best suits the Islamic scholarly tradition.

### Wilhelm Dilthey's Hermeneutics

Wilhelm Dilthey (1833-1911) was a German philosopher known for his contributions to the development of the theory of hermeneutics, a discipline concerned with how humans make sense of their lived experiences, especially in historical and cultural contexts. In contrast to classical hermeneutics which generally focuses on the interpretation of texts, Dilthey's hermeneutics emphasizes a comprehensive understanding of human experience as living history (Sholikah, 2017; Soebarna, 2021). Hermeneutics according to Dilthey is not just a method for interpreting texts, but also a fundamental approach to understanding the entire spectrum of human experience, both historical and cultural in nature, through the concept of understanding or *Verstehen*.

Dilthey developed hermeneutics as a response to positivism, which at that time dominated science with a rigorous scientific approach and relied on the method of explanation. Dilthey argued that human experience cannot be explained simply

through scientific laws as in the natural sciences (*Naturwissenschaften*). Therefore, he introduced a hermeneutical approach based on understanding the expression of human life, which he called *Geisteswissenschaften* or humanitarian science. In Dilthey's view, humans are living beings with consciousness and inner experiences that cannot be separated from their cultural and historical environment (Sholikah, 2017; Sidik & Sulistyana, 2021).

Dilthey's Hermeneutic Concepts  
Dilthey's hermeneutic thinking rests on several interrelated basic concepts, namely experience (*Erlebnis*), expression (*Ausdruck*), and understanding (*Verstehen*). These concepts form the basis of Dilthey's methodology in interpreting human life and history as a whole.

#### 1. Experience (*Erlebnis*)

Dilthey uses the term *Erlebnis* to describe an immediate and profound life experience. According to him, this experience is not just an isolated memory or remembrance of the past, but an integral part of one's consciousness. *Erlebnis* emphasizes that life experience has a moving and comprehensive quality, which cannot be rationalized or separated into separate parts. In *Erlebnis*, experience is understood as something that is felt in total and affects the individual's consciousness directly. This experience encompasses all aspects of life, from social interactions to complex personal feelings.

Dilthey viewed *Erlebnis* as the primary source for understanding human history and culture. This experience is not just about what happens, but how it is

perceived by the individual in a particular context. Thus, Dilthey's hermeneutics tries to explore life experiences that are integrated in the cultural and historical setting that surrounds them.

## 2. Expression (*ausdruck*)

In Dilthey's understanding, expression is the result of life experience manifested in various forms, whether through art, writing, behavior, or other cultural symbols. This expression reflects the inner understanding and emotional experience that a person feels. Dilthey argues that expression is not simply the result of a cognitive process, but rather the manifestation of a complex human inner life. He distinguishes expression into three main categories:

- a. Expression of Ideas (*Denkgebilde*): These expressions are mental constructs formed from structured concepts and thoughts, such as mathematical symbols, chemical formulas, or traffic rules. These expressions are formal and usually independent of individual subjectivity.
- b. Action Expression (*Handlung*): These expressions include behaviors or actions that reflect a certain intention. These actions not only result from rational thought but are also driven by the goals and values held by the individual.
- c. Spontaneous Expression (*Erlebnisausdruck*): Expressions that occur spontaneously and naturally, such as smiling, laughing, crying, or other emotional expressions. In these expressions, people's deepest feelings are expressed without being filtered by rational thought.

For Dilthey, understanding expressions is an important step towards understanding one's lived experience. These expressions connect inner experiences with outer reality and allow others to understand what the individual is feeling through actions or symbols.

## 3. Understanding (Verstehen)

Verstehen is the core of Dilthey's hermeneutics as opposed to *Erklären* or explanation used in the natural sciences. Understanding in this context means attempting to understand the deep meaning of one's lived experience, rather than simply knowing facts or information. Verstehen involves putting oneself in another person's shoes and understanding their world from their subjective perspective.

Verstehen serves as a method in the humanities, which takes into account the inner context and subjective purpose of a person in their actions. Dilthey emphasized that in Verstehen, experience and understanding are inseparable; understanding is always influenced by the inner experience that drives an individual. In the process of understanding, intense imagination and the ability to envision oneself in the situation experienced by another person are required.

## Historical Hermeneutics and Dilthey's Critique of

Dilthey's hermeneutics is often referred to as historical hermeneutics because of its focus on the historical context in understanding texts or symbols. Dilthey argues that a person's life experience is inseparable from their historical environment. To understand the meaning of

a text, one must delve into the author's historical context and the cultural environment that influenced his way of thinking.

In his critique of positivism, Dilthey stated that the highly exact and deterministic scientific approach is unable to capture the deep meaning of human life experience. Positivism, which emphasizes experiments and natural laws, is not suitable for understanding complex and dynamic human phenomena. Dilthey tried to offer an alternative method that is more suitable for humanitarian science, namely the method of understanding that emphasizes inner experience and historical context (Sholikah, 2017).

### **The Influence of Dilthey's Thought in Social Sciences and Humanities**

Dilthey's thoughts on hermeneutics and Verstehen had a huge impact on the development of social sciences and humanities. The Verstehen method became the basis for the thinking of sociologist Max Weber, who used this approach to understand human social action in the context of the meanings they give to each action. In addition, Dilthey's concepts of experience and understanding influenced psychological theory, especially in the individual psychology developed by Alfred Adler.

Through Verstehen, Dilthey also inspired the development of humanistic psychology that places individual experience at the center of understanding human beings. Dilthey's hermeneutics, which emphasizes the importance of historical context, inner

experience, and expression in understanding the meaning of life, provides a strong foundation for interpretive approaches in various disciplines, including sociology, anthropology, and cultural studies (Sitorus et al., 2022).

### **Contextualizing the understanding of hadith about music**

Human life may be attached to music, be it cultural, religious or wedding events. There is a Hadīth that describes the celebration of a wedding, holding it in the mosque, and playing the tambourine for it. The hadith is as follows:

Hadith narrated by Tirmidhiy(2009) in chapter *Majaa Fi I'lan al-Nikah* juz 3 index number 1089:

حَدَّثَنَا أَحْمَدُ بْنُ مَنِيعٍ حَدَّثَنَا يَزِيدُ بْنُ هَارُونَ أَخْبَرَنَا  
عِيسَى بْنُ مَيْمُونٍ الْأَنْصَارِيُّ عَنْ الْقَاسِمِ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ  
عَنْ عَائِشَةَ قَالَتْ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ  
أَعْلِنُوا هَذَا النِّكَاحَ وَاجْعَلُوهُ فِي الْمَسَاجِدِ وَاضْرِبُوا عَلَيْهِ  
بِالدُّفُوفِ قَالَ أَبُو عِيسَى هَذَا حَدِيثٌ غَرِيبٌ حَسَنٌ فِي  
هَذَا الْبَابِ وَعِيسَى بْنُ مَيْمُونٍ الْأَنْصَارِيُّ يُضَعَّفُ فِي  
الْحَدِيثِ وَعِيسَى بْنُ مَيْمُونٍ اللَّذِي يَرْوِي عَنْ ابْنِ أَبِي  
نَجِيحٍ التَّفْسِيرُ هُوَ ثِقَةٌ

*Ahmad ibn Mani' narrated to us Yazid ibn Harun narrated to us Isa ibn Maimun Al Anshari narrated to us from Al Qasim ibn Muhammad narrating from 'Aa'ishah that the Messenger of Allah said: Announce the marriage, hold it in the mosque, and beat the tambourine to announce it. Abu Isa said: This is a gharib hasan hadeeth in this chapter. 'Isa ibn Maimun Al Anshari is weakened in this narration. Isa ibn Maimun*

*who narrated from Ibn Abu Najih At-Tafsir is tsiqah*

The Hadīth in *Tuhfah al-Aḥwadhīy* states that marriage must be announced. The Hadith narrated by Al-Nasa'i, Ibn Majah, and Al-Hakim states that the Prophet said: Announce this marriage. That is, with evidence and testimony, this command may be obligatory or to indicate the importance of announcing and publicizing the marriage, as stated in His words: And perform it in the mosque. This indicates that the mosque is a better place for the announcement, either because it encourages more publicity or because of the blessing of the place. Regarding knocking with the *dufuf* (musical instrument), this should be done outside the mosque. The scholars stated that what is meant by *dufuf* is a musical instrument without a loud sound (*jalajil*).

The scholarly commentary of Ibn al-Humam states that this is not limited to women, but this view is considered weak. The stronger hadith indicates that this permission applies to women only, so men should not be involved, given the prohibition against imitating them.

I also said that the singing that is allowed in weddings is only for women and is not allowed for men. It is said that this *hadith is hasan gharib* in many copies. It is also mentioned by Sheikh Waliuddin in his *mishkat*, and there it is mentioned that it is narrated by Tirmidhi, who also states that it is *gharib* and does not mention the term *hasan*.

Likewise, al-Shawkani quotes this tradition in his *Nail*. Tirmidhi states that it is a *gharib* tradition and does not mention

*hasan*. Hence it seems that the copy possessed by the owner of the *Mishkat* and al-Shawkani is the correct one and Tirmidhi's weakness against Isa b. Maimun one of the narrators of this tradition indicates its authenticity.

Ibn Majah narrated this hadith with the words "Announce this marriage and beat it with drums." In the chain of transmission is Khalid b. Ilyas, who is considered weak. Regarding 'Isa b. Maimun 'Isa b. Maimun, an Ansar, is stated to be weak in the hadith. He is known as the former slave of Qasim b. Muhammad. Al-Bukhari called him an unreliable narrator while ibn Hibban regarded all his traditions as false. However Isa b. Maimun who narrated from Abu Najih was a trustworthy person.

Hafiz in *Tahzib al-Tahzib* mentions Isa ibn Maimun al-Jurashi al-Makki, known as Ibn Dayah. He is known as a narrator of tafsir and narrated from Mujahid and ibn Abi Najih, as well as many other narrators.

Duri said, according to ibn Ma'in, there is no problem with him. ibn Madini stated that he was a trustworthy person. Sufyan gave him precedence over Waraqah. al-Saji also rated him as trustworthy. Tirmidhi, Abu Ahmad al-Hakim, and al-Daraqutni also gave positive assessments of him.

### **Application in Modern life**

The application of Wilhelm Dilthey's hermeneutics in understanding hadith related to music can provide a more contextual and historical view of the message conveyed in the hadith. Dilthey, a German philosopher who focused his studies on the method of understanding (hermeneutics) in the

humanities, argued that to understand a text, including religious texts, one must take into account the cultural, social and historical context at the time the text appeared. This principle is important because hadith was born amidst the 7th century Arab culture, which is certainly different from the modern culture of today.

### **Dilthey's Hermeneutics in Understanding Music Hadiths**

Dilthey argued that an understanding of the text must involve the lived experience and social context behind it. In the case of the hadith about music, this means that we have to consider how music was viewed in the Arab society at the time of the Prophet as well as the purpose of the prohibition. Dilthey's hermeneutics would suggest that we look at whether music functions and has the same role in the context of the past and the present, so that it can be interpreted according to the times (Sholikah, 2017).

Today, music plays a very diverse and important role in the lives of modern society. Music is not only a medium of entertainment, but also a means of therapy, self-expression, and a medium for conveying social ideas and aspirations. As part of popular culture, music can influence individual thoughts and behaviors, and even have a positive impact on mental health, such as reducing stress or improving concentration.

For some in modern society, music is considered a psychological necessity that can provide relaxation, inspiration and happiness. Music also plays a role in establishing individual or group identity,

where certain genres of music can symbolize different expressions of self. Unlike the Prophet's time, when music may have had negative associations due to its link to excessive celebrations or unethical behavior, music in modern times is more institutionalized and has a higher artistic value.

### **Hadith Views on Music and Its Relevance in the Present Time**

Some traditions prohibit the use of certain musical instruments, such as flutes or stringed instruments, which are believed to distract from worship. However, some scholars differ in their understanding of these traditions, with some understanding them textually and prohibiting music in general, while others are more contextual and allow music as long as it does not contain content that is contrary to Islamic teachings (Nurdin et al., 2023; Ramadhan, 2024).

Dilthey's hermeneutical approach allows us to see that the prohibitions in the hadith may have been aimed more at the negative social aspects of music at that time, such as its use in the context of debauchery or as entertainment that distances from Islamic values. In the modern context, if music is utilized for positive purposes, such as enhancing happiness or strengthening social relationships without violating moral values, then the view on music can be more lenient and adjusted to the principles of maqasid sharia (the purpose of Islamic law).

According to Yusuf Al-Qaradawi, a contemporary scholar, music is not always absolutely forbidden in Islam. He argues that music that does not violate morals or invite

to evil is acceptable and permissible, as long as it maintains the moral boundaries taught in religion. This opinion is one example of the application of hermeneutics in understanding religious texts by taking into account the context of community development (Priyatna, 2025; D. Siregar, 2016).

### **Scholars' Opinions in Understanding the Legal Basis of Music**

The scholars have diverse views in determining the law regarding music. In fiqh, differences in views between one scholar and another are common. Almost all ijthadi issues are usually accompanied by a variety of legal views from the scholars. This is also the case with the ruling on music. Some scholars are of the opinion that music is allowed unconditionally, while others allow it with certain conditions. Some scholars prohibit music absolutely, while others forbid it with certain requirements (Fauzi, 2023; Mahmud, 2017; Ramadhan, 2024). Likewise, those who make allowances for various types of songs and musical genres, argue that music is halal and is part of the positive activities in life permitted by Allah for His servants. In this regard, there are scholars who legalize music and some who forbid it. Opinions of Scholars Who Legalize Music

قال العز بن عبد السلام: أما العود والآلات المعروفة ذوات الأوتار كالربابة والقانون، فالمشهور من المذاهب الأربعة أن الضرب به وسماعه حرام، والصح أنه من الصغائر. وذهبت طائفة من الصحابة والتابعين ومن الأئمة المجتهدين إلى جوازه

*Al-'Izz ibn 'Abd al-Salam said: "As for musical instruments such as the 'ud and the*

*known stringed instruments, such as the rebab and qanun, the overwhelming opinion of the four madhhabs is that playing them and listening to them is haraam. However, the more correct view is that it is a minor sin. Some of the Companions, the tabi'in and some of the mujtahid imams allowed their use.*

Abu Hanifah stated that music is forbidden and makrooh, and listening to it is considered a sin. This opinion was supported by the majority of Kufa scholars, such as Sufyan al-Tsauri, Hammad, Ibrahim, Shu'bi, and other scholars. These opinions were narrated by Al-Qadi Abu Tayyib al-Tabari.

Imam Malik strictly forbade music. He was of the opinion that if someone buys a slave girl and it is later discovered that the slave is a singer, the buyer has the right to return her because it is considered a defect. This opinion was followed by the majority of Madinah scholars, except Ibn Sa'id. This tradition was also practiced by the people of Madinah. Abu Talib admitted that he once saw Qadi Marwan asking his slave girl to sing in the presence of Sufis. Al-'Ata also had two slave girls who were proficient singers and often performed them before his brothers.

### **CONCLUSIONS**

The scholars of hadith have diverse views on the ruling of music. Some allow it unconditionally, others allow it with certain conditions, while others prohibit it absolutely. This difference is due to the variety of approaches in interpreting the hadith, especially in considering the social context and the objectives of the Shariah

(*maqasid al-shariah*). For example, Yusuf Al-Qardawi argues that music that does not conflict with moral values is acceptable as long as it remains in accordance with religious norms. Wilhelm Dilthey's hermeneutical approach, which emphasizes understanding the text in the context of history, culture and human experience, can provide a new perspective in understanding the prohibition of music in the hadith. The prohibition can be seen as a response to the social conditions of the time, where music was often associated with negative behavior. If analyzed through the perspective of *maqasid sharia*, music that has positive benefits, such as fostering happiness and strengthening social relationships, can be considered relevant and acceptable in Islam. The application of hermeneutics and *maqasid sharia* theory in understanding the hadith about music opens up opportunities for a more contextual and inclusive interpretation. This approach not only maintains the relevance of Islamic law in the face of modern realities but also ensures that the principles of sharia are preserved. Thus, the study of the law of music in Islam needs to be done holistically, taking into account universal values and the needs of the people in various aspects of life.

## REFERENCES

- Alfafa, Y. F. (2023). *Seni Musik Perspektif Quraish Shihab dalam Tafsir Al-Misbah*. Universitas Islam Negeri KH Abdurrahman Wahid Pekalongan. <http://etheses.uingusdur.ac.id/4301/>
- Alma'arif, A. (2017). Hermeneutika Hadis Ala Fazlur Rahman. *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Hadis*, 16(2), 243–

264.

- Amrulloh, A. (2015). Hadis sebagai Sumber Hukum Islam (Studi Metode Komparasi-Konfrontatif Hadis-Al-Qur'an Perspektif Muhammad Al-Ghazali dan Yusuf Al-Qaradawi). *IAIN Tulungagung Research Collections*, 3(2), 287–310. <https://ejournal.iain-tulungagung.ac.id/index.php/ahkam/article/view/391>
- Asaad, M. (2019). Kritik Hadis Berdasarkan Metodologi Hadis: Tawaran scientific Nuruddin 'Itr. *Farabi*, 16(1), 19–33. <https://journal.iaingorontalo.ac.id/index.php/fa/article/view/1032>
- At-Tirmidzi, M. I. (2009). *Sunan at-Tirmidzi*. Gema Insani.
- Aziz, M. A. (2009). Hadis-hadis tentang Seni Musik (Kajian Ma'anil Hadis). *Skripsi, Yogyakarta: Fakultas Ushuluddin UIN Sunan Kalijaga*. <https://digilib.uin-suka.ac.id/id/eprint/2977>
- Fauzi, A. (2023). Musik dalam Wacana Keagamaan: Sebuah Upaya Kontekstualisasi Hadis. *Mazalat Jurnal Pemikiran Islam*, 5(1), 36–57.
- Hafidhuddin, H. (2022). Kontestasi Hadis di Era Multimedia: Kajian Hadis di Youtube Mengenai Alat Musik. *Al-Bayan: Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Hadist*, 5(1), 30–42. <https://doi.org/10.35132/albayan.v5i1.182>
- Hasan, M. Z. (2020). Analisis Pemikiran Hermeneutika Hadis Yusuf Al-Qardhawi. *Al Irfani: Journal of Al Qur'anic and Tafsir*, 1(2), 33–46. <https://doi.org/10.51700/irfani.v1i2.111>
- Ismail, S. (1994). Hadis Nabi yang tekstual dan Kontekstual. *Jakarta: Bulan Bintang*.
- Izza, F. N. (2014). Hermeneutika: Arah Baru Interpretasi Hadis (studi Analisis Pemikiran Yusuf Al-Qardhawi Dalam Fatwa-Fatwanya). *Komunika: Jurnal*

- Dakwah Dan Komunikasi*, 8(2), 192–220.  
<https://doi.org/10.24090/komunika.v8i2.756>
- Mahmud, A. (2017). Musik; antara Halal dan Haram (Kajian Ma ‘ani al-Hadis). *Mafhum*, 2(2), 251–284.  
<https://jurnal.yudharta.ac.id/v2/index.php/mafhum/article/view/931>
- Makmur, M., & Ismail, M. (2021). Metode Kesahihan Sanad Hadis: Telaah terhadap Pemikiran Syuhudi Ismail dalam Kaidah Kesahihan Hadits. *Al-Mutsala*, 3(2), 85–95.  
<https://doi.org/10.46870/jstain.v3i2.50>
- Nurdin, M. S., Aco, I. F., & Idrus, R. R. (2023). Tinjauan Hukum Islam Mengenai Pengobatan Menggunakan Metode Terapi Musik. *Al-Qiblah: Jurnal Studi Islam dan Bahasa Arab*, 2(6), 674–705.
- Priyatna, D. H. (2025). *Hadis musik menurut Yusuf Qardawi dalam kitab Min Hady Al-Islam fatawa Mu'ashirah*. Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung.  
<https://digilib.uinsgd.ac.id/104253/>
- Rahman, D. A., Nurhandini, G. M., Fauziah, N. S., Nuralia, S. M., & Nurjaman, A. R. (2024). Seni Musik dan Lagu dalam Perspektif Islam. *Tashdiq: Jurnal Kajian Agama dan Dakwah*, 3(2), 91–100.
- Ramadhan, S. (2024). Mengeksplorasi Status Hukum Musik Melalui Perspektif Hadits. *El-Sunnah: Jurnal Kajian Hadis Dan Integrasi Ilmu*, 5(1), 72–93.  
<https://jurnal.radenfatah.ac.id/index.php/elsunnah/article/view/22199>
- Sani, A. (2023). Pergeseran Metodologi Kesahihan Sanad Hadis dalam Pemikiran Syuhudi Ismail. *El-Wasathy: Journal of Islamic Studies*, 1(2), 94–108.  
<https://doi.org/10.61693/elwasathy.vol12.2023.94-108>
- Sholikah, S. (2017). Pemikiran Hermenautika Wilhelm Dilthey (1833-1911 M). *Al Hikmah: Jurnal Studi Keislaman*, 7(2), 109–120.  
<https://doi.org/10.36835/hjsk.v7i2.3285>
- Sidik, H., & Sulistyana, I. P. (2021). Hermeneutika Sebuah Metode Interpretasi dalam Kajian Filsafat Sejarah. *Agastya: Jurnal Sejarah Dan Pembelajarannya*, 11(1), 19–34.  
<https://doi.org/10.25273/ajsp.v11i1.6224>
- Siregar, D. (2016). Analisis hadis-hadis tentang musik. *Forum Paedagogik*, 8(2), 174–192.  
<http://dx.doi.org/10.24952/paedagogik.v8i2.581>
- Siregar, I. R. (2024). Nuruddin ‘Itr’s Hadith Manhaj: A Significant Contribution to the Development of Hadith Studies. *Jurnal Studi Hadis Nusantara*, 6(2), 83–94.  
<http://www.syekhnuurjati.ac.id/jurnal/index.php/jshn/article/view/18636>
- Sitorus, H. J. C., Sauri, S., & Gultom, N. (2022). Hermeneutika Wilhelm Dilthey Sebagai Alat Interpretasi Karya Sastra. *Seminar Internasional Riksa Bahasa*, 208–214.  
<http://proceedings.upi.edu/index.php/riksabahasa/article/view/2634>
- Soebarna, A. B. (2021). Nilai-Nilai Kemanusiaan dalam Semangat Kenabian Muhammad Perspektif Hermeneutika Wilhelm Dilthey. *Himmah: Jurnal Kajian Islam Kontemporer*, 5(1), 25–37.  
<https://doi.org/10.47313/jkik.v5i1.1391>
- Sulidar, S., Ismahani, S., & Yazofa, T. (2022). Metodologi Penetapan Kaidah Kesahihan Hadis (Studi Komparatif Pemikiran M. Syuhudi Ismail dan Muhammad Al-Ghazali). *Shahih (Jurnal Kewahyuan Islam)*, 5(1).  
<http://dx.doi.org/10.51900/shh.v5i1.12480>
- Syahid, A. (2020). Telaah Hermeneutika Hadis Yusuf Al-Qardhawi. *Rausyan Fikr: Jurnal Ilmu Studi Ushuluddin*



*Dan Filsafat*, 16(1), 163–189.  
<https://doi.org/10.24239/rsy.v16i1.551>

Wahidi, F., Nasrullah, N., & Wahidi, R. (2022). Yusuf al-Qardhawi Memahami Hadis Nabi Saw. *Syahadah: Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Keislaman*, 10(2), 1–26. <http://www.ejournal.fiaiunisi.ac.id/index.php/syahadah/article/view/534>

Yeni, P., & Kurniawan, E. Y. (2024). Musik Dalam Perspektif Islam. *Jurnal Intelek Insan Cendikia*, 1(9), 5643–5650. <https://jicnusantara.com/index.php/jiic/article/view/1497>.